Stop Toxic Housing in Pasadena
May 5, 2021

Governor Gavin Newsom
State Capitol
Sacramento, CA 95814
Angela.pontes@gov.ca.gov

ProTem Tony Atkins
State Capitol
Sacramento, CA 95814
Kip.lipper@sen.ca.gov

Speaker Anthony Rendon
State Capitol
Sacramento, CA 95814
Marie.liu@asm.ca.gov
Senator Anthony Portantino, chair
Senate Appropriation Committee
State Capitol
Sacramento, CA 95814
sapr@sen.ca.gov

Senator Bob Wiekowski, chair
Subcommittee #2 on Resources, Environmental Protection and Energy
State Capitol
Sacramento, CA 95814
Joanne.Roy@sen.ca.gov

Assemblymember Lorena Gonzales, chair
Assembly Appropriation Committee
State Capitol
Sacramento, CA 95814
Jennifer.galehouse@asm.ca.gov

Assemblymember Richard Bloom, chair
Budget Subcommittee #3 on Climate Crisis, Resources, Energy, and Transportation
State Capitol
Sacramento, CA 95814
Shy.forbes@asm.ca.gov

Submitted via email

**RE: Opposition to raising fees at the Department of Toxic Substances Control before holding DTSC accountable for meeting its basic obligations and ensuring compliance with civil rights and environmental justice laws and policies**

Dear Governor Newsom, President pro Tempore Atkins, and Speaker Rendon:

We the undersigned community and environmental justice organizations call on you to take comprehensive action to ensure that the Department of Toxic Substances Control (DTSC) finally starts carrying out its mission to protect public health and the environment and complies with state and federal civil rights and environmental justice laws and policies.

DTSC needs fundamental change, not just more reports and plans that are never implemented. This broken agency has a well-documented and very long track record of failing to protect communities impacted by hazardous waste. Despite years of concerted efforts both by the legislature and by advocates to push for changes at DTSC, we have seen no improvement in DTSC’s ability and/or willingness to meet its most basic obligations.
As the administration grapples with how to ensure that DTSC has the funding needed to support its mission, we cannot afford to lose sight of the fact that a lack of funds contributes to--but is not the cause of--DTSC’s long-recognized failures.

DTSC continues to engage in lax and racially discriminatory oversight of hazardous waste facilities and inadequate cleanup of contamination sites in low income, working class, and people of color communities disproportionately impacted by pollution.

**Key concerns include:**

- **Enforcement of permit violations** is extremely lax and violations are not adequately punished.

- The state’s two hazardous waste landfills (Kettleman Hills and Buttonwillow) are allowed to operate for many years on **expired permits** that were originally issued with racially discriminatory processes in these Spanish-speaking farmworker communities. Many other hazardous waste facilities similarly operate on expired permits in communities of color. DTSC ignores community demands to shut these facilities and conduct proper and non-discriminatory permit processes if the companies want to resume operations;

- DTSC abandoned its commitment to implement a strong **Hazardous Waste reduction plan** to reduce the amount of toxic waste generated in the state and disposed of at the Kettleman Hills and Buttonwillow landfills – perpetuating the racially discriminatory siting and disposal of hazardous wastes in vulnerable communities of color;

- Residents continue to be at risk due to DTSC’s **refusal to conduct comprehensive and safe cleanup of contamination sites**, including at Exide, Pure-Gro (Brawley), Treasure Island, Bayview Hunters Point, Richmond, and many dozens of other contaminated sites. Exide is a significant example of how DTSC-lead efforts go poorly, yet it is not the only example of DTSC’s ongoing failure to ensure contaminated sites are clean and safe for reuse. For example, DTSC makes the unacceptable claim that it is safe for low income people of color in subsidized housing to live literally on top of or feet from radioactive and toxic waste on Treasure Island. In defiance of the state’s own scientific projections of sea-level rise caused by climate change, DTSC supports leaving radioactive and toxic waste buried at the shoreline of San Francisco Bay in environmental justice communities, where the contamination will likely be inundated and flooded in the coming decades;

- DTSC has consistently flouted its environmental justice mandate and is violating the civil rights of those disproportionately impacted by environmental harms caused by poorly regulated hazardous waste facilities and contaminated sites. For example, DTSC has failed to fully comply with the 2016 Kettleman City Title VI Civil Rights Settlement, including failing to adopt regulations to consider cumulative impacts in permit decisions.

Because of DTSC’s long, well-documented history of dysfunction, community members whose health is being impacted by toxic exposures, and their allies, we oppose increasing fees or taxes
before there is a clear plan for how DTSC will build effective regulatory and clean-up programs that center protecting front-line communities. Further, we are horrified by the idea that DTSC would receive $300 million for site investigations and remediation because we know--based upon DTSC’s record to date--that DTSC lacks the commitment to protection of public health which is necessary to properly and effectively spend that money. This includes addressing the critical question of “how clean is clean.”

A Community-Centered Path Forward: Real Community Oversight

Communities directly affected by hazardous waste facilities and toxic sites are most impacted by contamination and have the greatest interest of all in ensuring that DTSC is successful in its mission. For this reason, these communities should be centered in efforts to build an inclusive and just Path Forward for identifying DTSC’s priorities and developing a plan for reform. Frontline environmental justice communities require a seat at the decision-making table and must be meaningfully engaged in the discussions that lead to decisions that impact their health and the lives of their families. Environmental justice “seats at the table” cannot be token in an industry-dominated oversight board or committee.

Moving Forward for DTSC to Comply with its Mission, Civil Rights and Environmental Justice:

It will be instrumental to the success of DTSC to have full Environmental Justice participation and immediately begin real compliance with civil rights and environmental justice laws and policies as DTSC “reform” efforts move forward. As such, we call upon the administration to:

- require DTSC to explicitly and completely comply with civil rights laws and environmental justice policies in all their regulatory and permit actions and decisions, including compliance with all provisions of the Kettleman City Title VI Civil Rights Settlement;
- establish a stakeholder process that centers front-line communities in decision-making about DTSC’s priorities, planning, funding, and executing its mission;
- establish legislative oversight and strict accountability requirements over DTSC;
- develop a report that fully identifies and reviews all of DTSC’s obligations under state and federal law to facilitate a full discussion with stakeholders, including the legislature, about what, and how, DTSC should focus its resources and what level of funding is needed to allow DTSC to meet all of its obligations;
- require DTSC to develop and comply with metrics of success and other accountability measures before settling on the proper level of funding is for the agency;
- commit to meeting DTSC’s funding needs using an appropriate balance of the polluter-pays principle and general fund or other revenue streams.

Authorizing more funding coupled with promises from DTSC that this time will be different is not enough.

We look forward to working with you to ensure that DTSC can be successful in fulfilling its critically important mission “to protect California’s people and environment from harmful effects of toxic substances by restoring contaminated resources, enforcing hazardous waste laws, reducing hazardous waste generation, and encouraging the manufacture of chemically safer products.”
Sincerely,

Ms. Margaret Gordon  
Co-Coordinator  
West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project  
Oakland, CA

Nayamin Martinez, MPH  
Director  
Central California Environmental Justice Network

Arcela Núñez Alvarez  
Executive Director  
Universidad Popular

Angela Johnson Meszaros  
Managing Attorney  
Earthjustice

John Hernandez  
Director  
Our Roots-Multi Cultural Center  
Imperial Valley, CA

Luis and Daniela Flores  
Co-Organizers  
Imperial Valley Equity and Justice Coalition  
Imperial Valley, CA

Anna Lisa Vargas  
Communities for New California

Mitzi Shpak  
Executive Director  
Action Now  
No. Hollywood, CA

Leaotis Martin  
Co-Coordinator  
Bayview Hunters Point Mothers and Fathers Committee  
San Francisco, CA

Thomas Helme  
Coordinator  
California Environmental Justice Coalition (CEJC)  
State of California

Robina Suvol  
Director  
California Safe Schools

Luis Olmedo  
Executive Director  
Comite Civico del Valle, Inc  
Imperial County, CA

Ken Szutu  
Director  
Citizen Air Monitoring Network  
Vallejo, CA

Felipe Aguirre  
Director  
Comite Pro Uno  
Maywood, CA

Cynthia Babich  
Director  
Maricela Mares Alatorre  
Coordinator
Del Amo Action Committee
Torrance, CA

El Pueblo Para el Aire y Agua
Limpia/People for Clean Air and Water

Lauren Ornelas
Founder & President of the Board

Kristin Shrader-Frechette
Director

Food Empowerment Project
San Jose, CA

Stop Toxic Housing in Pasadena
Pasadena, California

Terrie Green
Coordinator

Bradley Angel
Executive Director

Shore Up Marin City
Marin City, CA

Greenaction for Health and Environmental Justice
San Francisco and Kettleman City, CA

Bianca Lopez
Co-Founder/Project Director

Guadalupe Rosales
Executive Director

Valley Improvement Projects
Stanislaus County, CA

La Union Hace La Fuerza
Mecca, CA

John Anderson
Elena Engel
Sara Greenwald
Co-Coordinators

Eric Reyes, Director
Isabel Solis, Coordinator

350 San Francisco

Los Amigos Del La Comunidad
Imperial Valley, California

Martha Dine Arguello,
Executive Director

Jesse Marquez
Executive Director

Physicians for Social Responsibility
Los Angeles, CA

Coalition For A Safe Environment
Wilmington, CA

Isabel Solis
Coordinator

Christian Torres
Coordinator

Coalición de la Buena Salud y Bienestar Comunitario
Imperial Valley, CA

Salud Sin Fronteras
Imperial Valley, CA

Eduardo Guevara
Director

Joe R. Gatlin
Vice President

Promotores Comunitarios del Desierto
Chiriaco Summit, CA

NAACP
San Pedro-Wilmington Branch
Ricardo Pulido 
Executive Director
Community Dreams
Wilmington, CA

Drew Wood
Executive Director
California Kids IAQ
Wilmington, CA

CC:

Senate Committee on Environmental Quality:
    Senator Benjamin Allen (Chair)
    Senator Patricia C Bate (Vice Chair)
    Senator Brian Dahle
    Senator Lena A Gonzalez
    Senator Nancy Skinner
    Senator Henry I. Stern
    Senator Bob Więckowski

Senate Budget Sub. 2 on Resources, Environmental Protection and Energy:
    Senator Bob Więckowski (Chair)
    Senator Brian Dahle
    Senator Mike McGuire
    Senator Henry I. Stern

Assemblymember Cristina Garcia, 58th District

Assembly Committee on Environmental Safety & Toxic Materials
    Assemblymember Bill Quirk, Chair
    Assemblymember Thurston "Smitty" Smith (Vice Chair)
    Assemblymember Dr. Joaquin Arambula
    Assemblymember Rebecca Bauer-Kahan
    Assemblymember Megan Dahle
    Assemblymember Chris R. Holden
    Assemblymember Devon J. Mathis
    Assemblymember Al Muratsuchi

Assembly Budget Sub. 3. Climate Crisis, Resources, Energy, and Transportation:
    Assemblymember Richard Bloom (Chair)
    Assemblymember Steve Bennett
    Assemblymember Laura Friedman
    Assemblymember Kevin Mullin
    Assemblymember Jim Patterson
    Assemblymember Luz M. Rivas
    Assemblymember Philip Y. Ting
    Assemblymember Vince Fong